

## Visualizing the Cologne Sappho: Mental Imagery through Chorality, the Sun, and Orpheus\*

*Anton Bierl*

### Introduction

My focus in this essay is on the visualizing quality of the Cologne Sappho fragment (henceforth CS = *P. Köln* inv. 21351 + 21376), all the while holding in mind its particular transmission history.<sup>1</sup> In volume 15 of the *Oxyrhynchus Papyri*, 26 line endings were published as *P. Oxy.* 1787 (fr. 1.1–25 and fr. 2.1). Lines 11–22 of fr. 58 v., of which the left margin is heavily damaged, can now largely be reconstructed, so that a complete poem has been recovered which seems to represent a lament on old age (I will designate this as τ, for Tithonus).

---

\* An earlier and longer version of this paper was first published electronically in German as Bierl (2008); on that occasion I was unable to take account of Yatromanolakis (2008) (which appeared in 2009) and the papers assembled in Greene and Skinner (eds) (2009). An English version with emphasis on the question of reperformance was published electronically as Bierl (2010). I thank audiences in Cambridge, Oxford, Berlin, Philadelphia, and Stanford for much useful criticism; I also thank Deborah Boedeker for a copy of her lecture delivered at the *Symposium Lesbium* at Molyvos, Lesbos 7–14 August 2005 (= Boedeker [forthcoming]), and Greg Nagy with whom I shared many discussions and papers (including Nagy [2009]) at an early stage. Independently of me, in two unpublished contributions at the conferences of *MOISA* (Lecce, Oct. 2010) and *NSACGS* (Yale, July 2011) Elisabetta Pitotto and Amedeo Raschieri take similar theoretical assumptions as their starting point; I thank them for giving me access to these papers and exchanging their view with me at a very late stage. See now also Pitotto (2010–2011). Just before submission of the typescript I became aware of Boehringer (2013), who comes to similar conclusions to my own as far as the ‘old age poem’ is concerned, and Calame (2013), on the pragmatics and the aspect of immortality. The kernel of my contribution with its main ideas was first composed in 2007 and presented as papers in Cambridge and Oxford in June 2008. Last but not least, I express my warmest gratitude to Vanessa Cazzato, André Lardinois, Richard Martin, and Natasha Peponi for their encouragement and editorial advice.

1 For a concise description of the Cologne papyrus and its relation to the Oxyrhynchus papyrus, see Obbink (2009). A high-resolution image of the papyrus can be viewed at <http://www.uni-koeln.de/phil-fak/ifa/NRWakademie/papyrologie/Verstreutepub/bilder/PK21351+21376r.jpg>.

While *P. Oxy. 1787* originated in the second century AD, the Cologne papyrus is to be dated on the basis of paleographical analysis to the Ptolemaic period, specifically to the early third century BC, and is thus the oldest extant fragment of Sappho. The 'old age poem', which presents and ends with Tithonus as a mythical exemplum, is preceded by the end of a poem (henceforth designated as A<sub>1</sub>), which differs from the text situated before T in *P. Oxy. 1787* (= fr. 58.1–10, henceforth A<sub>2</sub>). In the second column, after the eighth line, there follows a further fragment of a poem (here designated as O, for Orpheus) which, due to the writing, meter, and linguistic form, is certainly not to be ascribed to Sappho.<sup>2</sup>

The Cologne papyrus, around half a millennium older than the previously known Oxyrhynchus papyrus, is particularly interesting in that it does not come from a scholarly edition, but rather it is the product of earlier Hellenistic performance or reading practice which might still reflect earlier performance practices of the sixth and fifth centuries BC. We can therefore detect a very interesting case of diachronically shifting receptions of Sappho. After its original setting in the female Sapphic circle around 600 BC, the oral text was copied and transmitted via Panionic cities in Asia Minor and perhaps tyrannical courts like Polycrates' Samos until it reached Athens, which had grown under Pisistratus into the new cultural hub of the Hellenic world. Two new occasions of Sapphic reception were certainly of special significance, also in the fifth century: the symposium<sup>3</sup> and public festivals, particularly the Athenian Panathenaea.<sup>4</sup>

The great media revolution from a predominantly oral reception culture to a literate culture, starting with the late fifth century and culminating in the Hellenistic era with the establishment of the great Alexandrian library, is another decisive step in the reception of Sappho. The process of transmission of the songs can take various forms in papyrus rolls: the arrangement of the poems

2 Gronewald and Daniel (2004a), (2004b), (2005). See the overview based on the recent research by Gronewald and Daniel (2007a) and (2007b); Yatromanolakis (2008), and the essays collected in Greene and Skinner (eds) (2009). On different Hellenistic arrangements of Sappho and on *P. Oxy. 1787*, cf. Yatromanolakis (1999) and Puglia (2007).

3 On the reperformance of Sappho at symposia, cf. Plut. *Quaest. conv.* 1.622c, 7.711d; Gell. *NA* 19.9.3–4. On earlier visual sources, cf. Yatromanolakis (2007), esp. 51–164. Cf. Yatromanolakis (2008) 245–247; for the performance of *skolia* at symposia, cf. Yatromanolakis (2009c) 270–275. On the symposium, cf. Yatromanolakis (2009a).

4 Cf. also Boedeker (forthcoming); the publication by the Turin research group Buzzi et al. (2008), under the direction of Antonio Aloni; Yatromanolakis (2008) and (2009b) 220–225; Boedeker (2009), esp. 72–76; Lardinois (2009) esp. 47–48; Nagy (2009).

can now be determined by older reperformance traditions as well as by newer anthologies compiled according to modern Hellenistic tastes. In this era the audience develops a predilection for literary refinement as well as aesthetic and metapoetic *topoi*, and is eager to learn about the archaic woman poet's Panhellenic star-status. Moreover, religious concerns about the afterlife and mystery cults might have influenced the selection of passages.<sup>5</sup> The Cologne Papyrus, inasmuch as it is a 'best of' selection, thus probably reflects a post-classical Athenian reperformance tradition of fluid texts which, now transposed to new occasions, are assembled in a thematic order and sung consecutively.<sup>6</sup> In other words, it seems to be a transcript of this specific new practice in which even non-Sapphic songs can be linked to parts of Sapphic ones and sung in a *catena*.<sup>7</sup> In the slightly later canonical and scholarly Alexandrian edition in nine books, on the other hand, the texts were arranged according to meter, so that within each group the poems were copied alphabetically according to Sappho's first lines.<sup>8</sup>

With the discovery of the Cologne Sappho a debate has arisen as to whether or not the last four lines of fr. 58 v. (henceforth referred to as B) belong to song T, which can now be distinguished as a self-standing poem.<sup>9</sup> Can the song as it is preserved in the Cologne papyrus, that is to say ending with the Tithonus myth, give an intelligible and satisfactory resolution? In other words, is T (CS coll. i.12–15 and ii.1–8) complete as it is,<sup>10</sup> or was something omitted

- 
- 5 Cf. Hardie (2005) esp. 29–32. This makes the selection a veritable religious testimony, not least because, in the last anonymous poem of the Cologne papyrus, Orpheus is associated with Sappho. Previously, the lyric singer *par excellence* had never occurred in connection with Sappho; he is first attested by Simonides (*PMG* 567). Our understanding of Sappho has recently been altered in a significant respect on the basis of a new evaluation of the question of the afterlife and the existence of mysteries of the Muses: see Hardie (2004) and (2005). The discovery of the Cologne papyrus was itself in part the catalyst for this reassessment.
- 6 Cf. Posidippus fr. 55.2 B.-A. Σα(π)φώϊου εἰς ἀ(ρ)ων ὁάρους, 'love songs by Sappho, which flow out of one another and continue themselves'. Cf. Nagy (2009) 187. For a similar arrangement of arias taken from tragic choral songs, cf. Gentili (2006a) 37–72, esp. 37–49.
- 7 Cf. also Pitotto in Buzzi et al. (2008) 157–163 and Pitotto (2010–2011) 641–643.
- 8 In this latter edition, the occasion of the performance is also a criterion for the arrangement: the edition concludes with wedding songs in book nine.
- 9 Gallavotti (1962<sup>3</sup>) 113 and Di Benedetto (1985) 147 had already ventured the hypothesis that with fr. 58.11 v. a new poem begins.
- 10 Di Benedetto (2004) and (2006) 9–11; Luppe (2004); West (2005); Janko (2005); Bernsdorff (2004) and (2005); Geissler (2005); Hardie (2005) 13 n. 3, 28–29; Radke (2006); Rawles (2006a); Austin (2007); Steinrück (2007).

in the anthology?<sup>11</sup> Gregory Nagy has suggested—and I concur—that both versions are complete, but that they reflect different performance traditions, the original in Lesbos and the secondary in Athens.<sup>12</sup> At the private symposium or at the public Panathenaea only excerpts from various songs were presented, taken from a thematic compilation in order to achieve smoother transitions from one excerpt to the next.<sup>13</sup> The limits of a poem could thus be fluid, as the Cologne papyrus shows.

### Primary and Secondary Reception: The Choral Context

The division between primary and secondary intention as well as reception of performance is relevant for the evaluation of the so-called ‘old age poem’  $\tau$  and fr. 58 v. We have to find an answer to the question of what message Sappho originally wished to convey with such a text, and how the girls in her circle understood these words.<sup>14</sup> The poem displays certain parallels with fr. 16 v., the famous priamel fragment.<sup>15</sup> The girls are being prepared for their wedding, and in the chorus they are made conscious of the importance of an all-encompassing beauty. This instruction occurs not only through the didactic word but also by means of performance, which presupposes the engagement of their entire bodies and mediates a total experience through visual, acous-

11 Gronewald and Daniel (2004a); Puelma and Angiò (2005); Magnani (2005) 43; Latacz (2005); Edmunds (2006); Livrea (2007) 69–70; Burzacchini (2007) 102–110; Lardinois (2009); Edmunds (2009).

12 Nagy (2009) 186. Cf. already Boedeker (2009) (even speaking of ‘Sapphic *mouvance*’, 72–76) and (forthcoming); Lardinois (2009) 48 and Yatromanolakis (2008).

13 For anthologies that contain excerpts from poems, cf. the examples given by Lundon (2007) 160 n. 52 and Yatromanolakis (2008) 248–250. For the technique of borrowing, adaptation, and anthologizing in archaic performance composition cf. Gentili (1984) 64–66 = (2006b) 79–81, with the summary: ‘Una tecnica di tipo associativo o antologico che permetteva di riutilizzare testi già pronti, appartenenti al repertorio tradizionale o composti dal poeta stesso per altre analoghe occasioni’, (1984) 66 = (2006b) 81 (in English, Gentili [1988] 49).

14 In light of the new emphasis on questions of reperformance, I do not share commentators’ recent reservations (e.g. Yatromanolakis [2007], esp. 33–34) about the usual efforts to reconstruct the original setting of Sappho. Such postmodern skepticism against unidirectional constructs of grand narratives and fictionalizations would exclude any possibility of understanding the primary context and intention.

15 For the priamel fragment, see my more detailed discussion in Bierl (2003).

tic, tactile, olfactory, and kinaesthetic signals.<sup>16</sup> Sappho thus assumes a living choral culture for the reception of her poetry, even when the songs are performed by an individual singer.<sup>17</sup> I designate this phenomenon as the ‘virtual chorus’:<sup>18</sup> although her songs may not have been sung by a chorus, Sappho nonetheless notionally employs the girls’ chorus of her circle as a cultural and visual reference point that is omnipresent for the girls.<sup>19</sup> Perhaps the maidens did, in fact, dance to the song as well.

In a traditional society, which defined itself to a considerable extent through myth and ritual, it is precisely such mythic-ritual discourses in the choral *paideia* that assume central importance. Music, rhythm, and collective movement to song and melody lead to a deeper understanding of beauty. The education in *bellezza* is also reinforced through premarital homosexual relationships among the girls in the group. The attraction of the girls for one another as well as that between the perfect chorus-leader Sappho and individual group members results in a comprehensive aesthetic training. In a process similar to that depicted by Plato in the *Symposium*, through physical love one acquires increased sensitivity and greater insight into nature, the environment, the cosmos, and aristocratic values. This common training also provides an aesthetic acquaintance with the media that strengthen these feelings—words, music, and dance—which together mediate visual poetry.<sup>20</sup> In a permanent synaesthesia, attraction and learning combine in a cognitive awareness of *to kallos* in an almost philosophical sense.<sup>21</sup> The noble girls are thus prepared for their marriage, for which they need both physical and inner beauty, and in the recollection of their shared experiences beauty is kept alive even after they have left the Sapphic community.

16 Cf. here Bierl (2001) (in English, Bierl [2009]).

17 On the possibility of an actual performance by a chorus, for example of fr. 16, 31, and 96 v., cf. Lardinois (1996) 169–170. On Sappho generally as a chorus leader, cf. Calame (1977) I 127, 369–370 (in English, Calame [1997] 65, 212); Lardinois (1994) esp. 73 n. 61; *contra*: Parker (1993) 331–333. On the chorus as the social context of initiation, cf. e.g. Calame (1977) I 385–420 (in English, Calame [1997] 221–244) and Bierl (2001) (in English, Bierl [2009]) Index s.v. ‘Erziehung’ and ‘παίδεια’. On the chorus in Sappho, cf. Bierl (2003) 118 nn. 100–101 and fr. 16.17–18, 24a(?), 44, 94.27(?), 103 v.

18 On the choral elements of fr. 58 v., cf. West (2005); Di Benedetto (1985) 148–149; Lardinois (1996) 169 (she sings, as the chorus dances); cf. also Hardie (2005) esp. 27–32; Lardinois (2009).

19 On Sappho’s circle, cf. Merkelbach (1957) and Gentili and Catenacci (2007).

20 On fr. 16, cf. Bierl (2003).

21 On the (proto-)philosophical in Sappho, esp. in fr. 16, cf. duBois (1995) 77–97, 98–126, esp. 101, 105–115. Cf., on fr. 58 v., Greene (2009).

In a secondary stage of reception, the aesthetic and philosophical potential of these poems within the female circle can then influence the male sphere. Thus Sappho's poetry found entry to the symposium and achieved Panhellenic status as a cultural achievement, so that it was also performed at larger festivals.<sup>22</sup> In this process, the songs are removed from their original, pragmatic *Sitz im Leben* and can assume new functions and meanings. They can be combined according to internal criteria alone, without reference to their function within the girls' group.<sup>23</sup>

In many respects, Sappho represents the 'closest foreign' of Greek culture.<sup>24</sup> It is my contention that the focal point of the Cologne Sappho, the 'old age poem', is not the vexed outcry of the individual lamenting her condition; rather, it has to do with aesthetic education in the Sapphic circle and with ideas of rejuvenation. Moreover, its entire meaning is acted out against the visual foil of a living culture of chorality, where the education of young women in social roles and gender values takes place. The central myth is not simply a narration, but an exemplary reflection, a piece of cultural memory that confers social cohesion, acted out in the imagery of choral dance.<sup>25</sup>

### The Look of Lyrics and Iconic Poetics

Lyric song depends heavily on visual images and tableaux. But whereas other genres tend to describe or represent scenes or visual impressions so that they are clearly envisaged and fully alive before the mind's eye of the recipients, lyric poems tend to provide no more than a rough sketch. Whereas *ekphrasis* in epic, Hellenistic poetry, or prose narrative reenacts the pictorial with *enargeia* and brings it to life, Sappho often no more than alludes to the visual in order to convey didactic messages to the members of her circle. The recipients have

22 Cf. Bierl (2003). On Panhellenism, cf. Mitchell (2007).

23 On the transition to 'literature' from the perspective of fr. 31 v., cf. Rösler (1990) esp. 271–272, 285–286 and Bierl (2003) 122–123, with reference to fr. 1 v.6.

24 Hölscher (1965) 81: 'das nächste Fremde', on how Greek culture can be felt to be at once estranging and very close.

25 Such a view is radically different from subjective and feminist approaches; among others, cf. Winkler (1981); Parker (1993); duBois (1995); most of the contributions in Greene (ed.) (1996); Williamson (1995); Wilson (1996); Stehle (1997) 262–318. These contributions anachronistically reproject the modern view of the female individual to a traditional society of alterity, where gender roles are rather strictly defined. Against this neoliberal, feminist approach, cf. also Calame (1998); Bierl (2003); Gentili and Catenacci (2007).

to supplement this information within the range of a cultural imagery that is mentally generated in what Aristotle called *phantasia* (*de Anima* 428a1). For such mental imagery Aristotle already used the term *phantasma* (*ibid.*), though he did not apply it to inner images in the Sapphic sense.<sup>26</sup>

In Sapphic poetry the visual dimension is generally blended with auditory, kinaesthetic, olfactory, and haptic ‘imagery’ to produce an effect of synaesthesia. The actual song, its sound, music, rhythm, and movement, is connected with the iconic, with specific images or impressions, which can be seen in the *hic et nunc* or are projected onto elsewhere by means of the imagination. Rituals and myths typically underline these sensations. The festival, the occasion of the song, emphasizes the synaesthetic experience, which finds its way into its poetic discourse, and it supports the highly sensational atmosphere of the poem in performance as well as the written text. Myths, on the other hand, with their intense potential for creating mental visions and perceptions, frequently serve as additional examples or proofs of statements.

Poetry generates pictures by means of tropes, particularly through metaphorical language, and by evoking iconic scenarios. In the archaic song culture visualizing occurs both with reference to stimuli that are before the eyes and in the absence of such stimuli—in Bühler’s terms through *deixis ad oculos* or *ad phantasma* respectively.<sup>27</sup> In short, Sappho conjures up images by referring to impressions that are actually present in the *hic et nunc* (at least in the original occasion of the primary reception, e.g. the bodies of young choral dancers) or she stimulates vision in the mind’s eye of the recipients by mentally produced imagery.

Metaphors, the quintessential source of visualizing in language, often represent the vessel for myths and rituals.<sup>28</sup> Ancient songs are frequently embedded in ritual and mythic scenes or in tableaux. Image, performance, environment, mental concepts all enter into the texture of a poem in a dialogic manner.<sup>29</sup>

26 Cf. e.g. Arist. *de Anima* 428a1–5: εἰ δὴ ἐστὶν ἡ φαντασία καθ’ ἣ λέγομεν φάντασμα τι ἡμῖν γίνεσθαι καὶ μὴ εἶ τι κατὰ μεταφορὰν λέγομεν, (ἄρα) μίᾳ τις ἔστι τούτων δύναμις ἢ ἕξις καθ’ ἃς κρίνομεν καὶ ἀληθεύομεν ἢ ψευδόμεθα; τοιαῦται δ’ εἰσὶν αἴσθησις, δόξα, ἐπιστήμη, νοῦς. [If then imagination is that in virtue of which an image arises for us, excluding metaphorical uses of the term, is it a single faculty or disposition relative to images, in virtue of which we discriminate and are either in error or not? The faculties in virtue of which we do this are sense, opinion, science, intelligence (Trans. J.A. Smith)] and Nussbaum (1978) (citing and discussing numerous passages).

27 Cf. Bühler (1934) and Bierl (2001) 38 n. 63 (in English, Bierl [2009] 24 n. 63).

28 Cf. Alexiou (2002) esp. 317–319.

29 Cf. Ferrari (2002) esp. 61–86.

Furthermore, a metaphor can generate a ritual by setting further metaphors in motion which are activated through similarity and/or contiguity.<sup>30</sup> Myth often transforms ritual in performance and accompanies it with stories. It is multidimensional, dynamic, and in constant movement or transfer,<sup>31</sup> and it draws on the visual to a large extent.

I argue that Sappho builds her poetic discourse in general, and the poems of the Cologne papyrus in particular, on very specific cultural and visual patterns which help to shape cognitive reception through mental imagery, especially in oral performance contexts.<sup>32</sup> Moreover, rituals and myths can function as a decisive framing device to determine the visualizing force.

Thus it will become evident that A<sub>1</sub> is based on the actual festivity, music, and performance. In the new poetics of an anthology these themes provide a fluid transition to the central poem T so that one can maintain that A<sub>1</sub> is the proem to T. The central song on old age further draws on images and concepts of chorality of the Sapphic circle as virtual chorus, and the exemplary myth reflects these cultural pictures of dancing in a solar context. Old age is conveyed by very drastic symptoms in the body, while the physical parts affected are all linked to choral dancing. Furthermore, the myth becomes effective only by reference to the visual perception of Tithonus and Eos, as it manifests itself on later vase paintings and in larger narratives. The last four lines (B) are again deeply embedded in solar imagery, which gives way to the solar connections to Orphism in the last, non-Sapphic passage (O). It will be demonstrated that without visualization and contextualization in cultural and anthropological images and concepts such as the daily change from night to daylight, choral dancing, renewal, rejuvenation, and hope for the afterlife, we risk missing the sense of the centerpiece (T) of the Cologne Papyrus. As a result, it has been widely read as a subjective and personal lament on the depressing effects of old age.

Let us take a look at the text in its entirety.

---

30 Cf. Fernandez (ed.) (1986) and (1991).

31 Cf. Alexiou (2002) 166.

32 On mental imagery and cognitive psychology, cf. e.g. Finke (1989); Richardson (1999); Denis (1991); Kosslyn et al. (2006); on textual iconicity, cf. e.g. Iser (1976) esp. 221–222; Lerchner (2000); on iconicity and ‘traditional referentiality’ in Homer, cf. e.g. Foley (1999).



### The New First Part (A<sub>1</sub>)

A<sub>1</sub> (= *P. Köln* col. i.1–11) is apparently the end of a poem, in which Sappho returns to the present (νῦν) and at this point speaks of her position of honor as a poetess in Hades after her death, which she describes as identical to the prestige she enjoys in her earthly life.

] πα  
] . αι  
] . α

5       ] . ο . [  
] . υχ . . . . [  
] . νῦν θαλ[ί]α γ . [  
] . γέρθε δὲ γὰς γε . [...] . .  
] . . γ ἔχοισα γ γέρας ὡς [ἔ]οικεν  
] . οἰεν ὡς νῦν ἐπὶ γὰς ἔοισαν  
10     ] λιγύραν, [α]ἴ κεν ἔλοισα πάκτιν  
] . . . . α . κάλα, Μοῖσ', αἰείδω.

...  
now enjoyment of the celebration  
beneath the earth  
having the honor, as is only right,  
as now, being still alive ('upon the earth'),  
the light-toned, if reaching for the harp  
beautiful things, Muse, I sing.<sup>33</sup>

Sappho clearly returns to the frame and the parameters of performance in a concluding coda in which she addresses the festive enjoyment of the chorus in singing and dancing. She imagines herself in Hades after her death and vividly pictures how, even there, she will be granted a place of honor as a singer. She desires for herself the explicit admiration among the dead that she still enjoys among the living. Her present fame parallels her reputation in the realm of the dead. In their mystery cults, the Muses inspire conceptions of an existence in the afterlife which reflects that on earth.<sup>34</sup>

This is more than merely the wish for κλέος ἀφθιτον, 'immortal fame', on the part of the poet. Sappho illustrates her situation when she crosses the

33 Text by Gronewald and Daniel (2004a) 2, 4–5, and Gronewald and Daniel (2007a) 4, 6.

34 Cf. Hardie (2005) esp. 22–32.

threshold of death in concrete terms: her existence in the afterlife resembles that which she now enjoys. In Hades, she will reach for her lyre and begin to sing, accompanied at least in imagination by the dance of the girls' chorus, just as she does now. She imagines how she will be admired by the souls gathered about her, who will also form a choral circular dance.

In the underworld as in this world above, Sappho needs the inspiration of the Muse. The last two lines establish a chiasmic mirroring of the first two lines of the following poem (T.1–2) and thus form the prelude to the song about old age. One motif proceeds from the other, while the rhythm remains unchanged. As in A1, death and the overcoming of death, performance in the chorus, the Muse, immortality, and the recovery of youth are presented in a utopian, pastoral context.

### The Poem on Old Age (T)

In the reconstruction of West (2005), the centerpiece T of the Cologne papyrus (= *P. Köln* coll. i.12–15 and ii.1–8) reads thus:

ὔμμες πεδὰ Μοῖσαν ἰ]οκ[ό]λπων κάλα δῶρα, παῖδ<sub>1</sub>ε<sub>1</sub>ς,  
σπουδάσδετε<sup>35</sup> καὶ τὰ]γ φιλάοιδον λιγύραν χε<sub>1</sub>λύνναν<sub>1</sub>.

35 Di Benedetto (2005) 17–18 regards West's emendations ([2005]) πεδὰ and σπουδάσδετε in line 1 as scarcely plausible. The girls have to attend to the Muses and the gifts of the Muses, so that Μοῖσαν would then stand *apo koinou* in two syntactically different relations. Moreover σπουδάσδειν is perhaps not the most suitable verb, and even the construction with the accusative is somewhat unusual. Di Benedetto (2005) 18 therefore proposes: ὔμμιν φίλα Μοῖσαν ἰοκόλπων κάλα δῶρα, παῖδες / πρέπει δὲ λάβην τὰν φιλάοιδον λιγύραν χελύνναν. This supplement would give a welcome contrast to the dative ἔμοι. Thus: 'Let the gifts of the violet-bosomed Muses be dear to you, girls. / It is right to take up (perhaps also ἔλγν) the song-loving, light-toned lyre.' Cf. Gronewald and Daniel (2004a) 7: φέρω τάδε Μοῖσαν ἰοκόλπων κάλα δῶρα, παῖδες, / λάβοισα πάλιν τὰν φιλάοιδον λιγύραν χελύνναν. There then follows: 'Age has already taken hold of me'. West's difficult suggestion admittedly captures more effectively the busy activity, the movement of the choral dance directed towards the Muses and Sappho. Perhaps we should simply replace σπουδάσδετε with ὄρχησθέ τε. Thus: ὔμμες παρὰ οἱ περὶ (οἱ κατὰ οἱ διὰ) Μοῖσαν ἰοκόλπων κάλα δῶρα, παῖδες, / ὄρχησθέ τε καὶ τὰν φιλάοιδον λιγύραν χελύνναν, 'You dance to/beside the beautiful gifts of the violet-bosomed Muses (around the ..., according to the ... because of the ...), girls, and also to the (around, according to, because of the) song-loving light-toned lyre'. On the prepositions, for παρὰ 'at, beside', cf. Sappho fr. 168B.3 v. and for περὶ 'all around', Sappho fr. 154.2 v., to be understood in terms of the disconnection from the object as *tmesis*; for κατὰ or διὰ, where a dactylic form should be assumed (Sappho fr. 44.12 v.), cf. Hamm (1957) 110–111 § 195 a and b,

- ἔμοι δ' ἄπαλον πρίν] ποτ' [ἔ]οντα ἰχρό<sub>1</sub>α γήρα<sub>1</sub>ς ἤδη  
 ἐπέλλαβε, λεύκαι δ' ἐγ'ένοντο τρίχες ἐκ μελαίναν·  
 5 βάρυς δέ μ' ὁ [θ]ῦμος πεπόηται, γό<sub>1</sub>να<sub>1</sub> δ' [ο]ῦ φέ<sub>1</sub>ροισι<sub>1</sub>,  
 τὰ δὴ ποτα λαίψηρ' ἔον ὄρχησθ' ἴσα νεβρίοισι.  
 τὰ (μὲν) στεναχίσδω θαμέως· ἀλλὰ τί κεν ποεῖην;  
 ἀγήραον ἄνθρωπον ἔοντ' οὐ δύνατον γέν<sub>1</sub>εσθαι<sub>1</sub>.  
 καὶ γάρ π[ο]τὰ Τίθωνον ἔφαντο βροδόπαχυ<sub>1</sub> ἸΑῦων<sub>1</sub>  
 10 ἔρωι φ . . ἀθειςαν βάμεν' εἰς ἔσχατα γὰς φέ<sub>1</sub>ροισα[ν,  
 ἔοντα [κ]άλλον καὶ νέον, ἀλλ' αὐτον ὕμω<sub>1</sub>ς ἔμ<sub>1</sub>αρψε<sub>1</sub>  
 χρόνωι πρόλιον γήρας, ἔχ[ο]ντ' ἀθανάταν ἄ<sub>1</sub>κοιτιν<sub>1</sub>.

[You for] the fragrant-blossomed Muses' lovely gifts  
 [be zealous,] girls, [and the] clear melodious lyre:  
 [but my once tender] body old age now  
 [has seized;] my hair's turned [white] instead of dark;  
 my heart's grown heavy, my knees will not support me,  
 that once on a time were fleet for the dance as fawns.  
 This state I oft bemoan; but what's to do?  
 Not to grow old, being human, there's no way.  
 Tithonus once, the tale was, rose-armed Dawn,  
 love-smitten, carried off to the world's end,  
 handsome and young then, yet in time grey age  
 o'ertook him, husband of immortal wife.<sup>36</sup>

on διά, also 26 §52b. Or in place of ὄρχησθε, we might insert παίζειν, the other verb for dancing, with a temporal marker νῦν (or αὖ) παίσητε καὶ, or ἐμπαίσητε καὶ. However, the latter is scarcely used as absolute verb, but rather always with dative: ὡς νεβρός γλοεραῖς ἐμπαίζουσα λείμακος ἠδοναῖς (Eur. *Bacch.* 866–867); τοῖς χοροῖσιν ἐμπαίζει (Ar. *Thesm.* 975, according to R); perhaps παίσησθε τε καὶ or δίννητέ τε καὶ. Ferrari (2010) 194, in addition to the emendation of Di Benedetto (2004) 5, χορεύσατε κάτ, proposes provisionally ἐλίσσητε κάτ. Also in line 1: αἰ στέργετε Μοῖσαν ... / ... 'If you, girls, love the beautiful gifts of the violet-bosomed Muses, / dance to the sound of the song-loving light-toned lyre!' Or χορεύσατε καί, or like Di Benedetto ([2004] 5) χορεύσατε κάτ. Di Benedetto (2004) 5 emends: γεραίρετε Μοῖσαν ἰοκόλπων κάλα δῶρα, παῖδες. / χορεύσατε κάτ τὰν φιλάοιδον λιγύραν χελύνναν—'Honour the beautiful gifts of the Muses, girls: *dance* to the song-loving light-toned lyre', an idea which he then apparently ([2005] 18) abandons. Austin (2007) 116–118 suggests: Μοῖσαν ἐπιδειξασθ' ἰοκόλπων κάλα δῶρα, παῖδες. / ἐγέρρατέ τ' αὖ τὰν φιλάοιδον λιγύραν χελύνναν. For numerous proposed emendations of τ, cf. Gronewald and Daniel (2007a) 8–11; Burzacchini (2007) 98; Livrea (2007) 73–74.

- 36 Text by Gronewald and Daniel (2004a) 4–5, and Gronewald and Daniel (2007a) 7–8, with the reconstructions by West (2005) 5 and his translation.

The song  $\tau$  is structured as follows:

- 1–2 (CS col. i.12–13): Appeal to the girls to dance according to her music
- 3–6 (CS coll. i.14–ii.2): Old age
  - 3–4a: Contrast: My old age
  - 4b–6: Symptoms (white hair, heavy heart, feeble knees)
- 7–8 (CS col. ii.3–4): Reaction
  - 7: Sigh; question: ‘what shall I do?’
  - 8: Gnostic saying
- 9–12 (CS col. ii.5–8): myth as example—Tithonus

The poem is characterized by opposites. The girls should devote themselves to the Muses, who will help them to coordinate their movement. Sappho sets the rhythm and melody with the lyre. The situation of the chorus is decisive. In contrast to the girls summoned to the round dance, the lyric ‘I, who here is certainly Sappho—for a repeated performance, however, any woman can assume her place—positions herself opposite the group of young girls at the emphatic first verse position in line 3. Age has conquered her body, her skin: now it is weak, fragile, but once, like the young *paides* who engage in *paizein*, dancing, it was nimble and agile (*ἄπαλον πρίν ποτ’*).<sup>37</sup> Initially, the entire body is addressed. The choral dance expresses itself entirely in physical movement. Then the corporeal entity is divided into three sections in the perspective *a capite ad calcem*:

1. The hair, the youthful glory which characterizes the beauty of the dancing girls, has become white. Above all, the earlier condition, black hair, which the girls still have, is emphasized. White and black mark the beginning and end of the colon.
2. The heart, the [θ]ῦμος, localized in the diaphragm, represents emotional energy defined as an organ. As with *τρίχες*, the noun is again placed at the center, while ‘heavy’ stands like ‘white’ as the predicate adjective in an emphatic first position. Just as abstract old age has overcome the ‘I’ and the hair has been subjected to a process of change (*ἐγένοντο*), so here the entire drama is rendered in the perfect passive of *ποιεῖν*. The subject is helpless; she is condemned to an inevitability which she endures. The mood, the gay dis-

37 Cf. fr. 16 *incert.* (Sappho or Alceus) v.: *Κρήσσαι νύ ποτ’ ὦδ’ ἐμμελέως πόδεσσιν / ὄρχηνητ’ ἀπάλοισ’ ἀμφ’ ἐρόεντα βῶμον*, where the feet in the dance are described as nimble; similarly Hes. *Theog.* 3–4, in the appeal to the Muses. The adjective *ἄπαλος* thus belongs in the context of the chorus.

position which manifests in the lightness (cf. ἄπαλον) of bodily movement, is dampened. Physical weight prevents gliding and rising into the air.

3. The knees, which metonymically and as synecdoche represent the legs, suggest the movement in dance. Following the *Gesetz der wachsenden Glieder*, they are explained with a relative sentence or with a deictic main sentence (6): ‘These were once light’—in chiasmus the often expanded ἄπαλον πρίν] ποτ’ in line 3 is resumed—‘to dance.’ The knees were like those of young deer.<sup>38</sup>

In line 7, we come to the passive enduring of age that overcomes the victim, and the subject’s reaction: ‘I lament this often—I sigh often and groan.’ The ‘I’ asks almost with resignation: ‘But what should I then do?’ The question is rhetorical: Sappho cannot actively do anything against it. Aging is an inevitable natural process. There follows the asyndetically justifying gnomic statement: as in fr. 16.21 v., the formula οὐ δύνατον γένεσθαι appears at the end (8). That which is most decisive is again placed in the first, emphatic position. As a human being (ἄνθρωπον ἔοντ’), one cannot become ἀγήραον (8); γένεσθαι recalls the ἐγένοντο of the changing color of the hair (4). The adjective, negated with the alpha privative, is with a further explicit negation effectively affirmed in a kind of litotes.

A mythic example is introduced in support of this thesis and justified with γάρ (9). The myth, the authoritative word, is appealed to in the past tense:<sup>39</sup> ‘And it was said, that once’—the ποτα is again taken up, contrasting with the here and now of the performance—‘that Eos abducted Tithonus’. Tithonus is placed in extreme prolepsis: he is the decisive example. As a man, he will still grow old, although a goddess loves him and seeks to obtain immortality for him—forgetting in the process, however, to request that he also remain ageless. Eos is a companion of Helios: she travels the heavenly course in his tracks. Besides sunrise, she symbolizes the entire day, and pursues her journey with undivided attention on Helios, accompanied by her herald, the morning star Eosphorus. Love and sexuality are localized in the realm of night, death, the subconscious mind, dreams, and the ocean.<sup>40</sup> Recreation is identified with the

38 The comparison of young dancing girls with deer is common; cf. the Homeric *Hymn to Demeter* 174–175; Bacchyl. 13.86–90; Eur. *El.* 860–861, *Bacch.* 862–867, esp. 866; Ar. *Lys.* 1318–1319, *Thesm.* 1180. The Dionysian deer calf is often associated with dancing Maenads. Cf. also Méndez Dosuna (2008).

39 Edmunds (2006). On the mythical example, cf. now Edmunds (2009).

40 On this aspect as well as the subject of rejuvenation, cf. Nagy (1990) 226–262, esp. 260–262, to whom Gronewald and Daniel (2004a) 3 also refer. Cf. also Nagy (1996) 87–103 and (2009).

sexual. Following the effort of the journey, the aging of the day, one then retires to the shared bed, in order to return rejuvenated to the next day's labors.

The abduction undoubtedly occurs as a result of erotic desire. The personified dawn, enflamed with love, transports the son of the Trojan king to the edge of the world, to Ethiopia. Eos abducts Tithonus under the effect of his beauty and youth (11), and she enjoys physical love with him at the end of the earth. She must still return there daily from the West, like Helios, but in spite of the love of a goddess, Tithonus is in the course of time overcome with grey old age (12). The attribute 'grey' refers back to the 'greying' and the white color of the hair in line 4.

The micro-narration is restrained to such a minimum that the circumstances of Tithonus' misfortune are not explicitly mentioned. We know from the *Homeric Hymn to Aphrodite* (221–224) that Eos, out of negligence and foolishness, forgot to ensure the agelessness of her beloved when obtaining immortality for him. In a traditional, oral society the audience would have been familiar with the variants of the myth. In artistic representations, Tithonus is depicted as a beautiful young man, wearing a crown and holding a lyre in his hand. He is obviously also a servant of the Muses who brings them gifts.<sup>41</sup> Eos' conventional violence in seizing male youths like Cephalus is transferred here to the terrors of aging: it attacks him even though he is the beloved of his immortal spouse. ἔμαρψε stands conspicuously at the end of the line; while it was initially Eos who captured him, now it is 'grey old age' which does so.

The mythic example is manipulated in a complex manner similar to that of the Helen myth in fr. 16 v.,<sup>42</sup> where too the allusions are unusually ambivalent.<sup>43</sup> After beginning with a reflection on her own aging, Sappho compares herself clearly with Tithonus: once young and beautiful, now she too has grown old. Both figures are also characterized by the lyre-playing of the Muses and singing, and they continue to sing as they become older.<sup>44</sup> Sappho, however, also reflects

41 See, above all, the famous painting of the pursuit of Tithonus by Eos on the red-figure vase by the Achilles painter (470–460 BC), found in Vulci (Louvre G438). On several other vases Tithonus is represented as a singer and lyre player (e.g. Boston 03.816, Museum of Fine Arts, ca. 480 BC).

42 Cf. Bierl (2003) 107–112.

43 Cf. Bierl (2003) 108 n. 60, 111 n. 74 for further literature.

44 Tithonus is ultimately confined to the bedroom and fed on nectar, while his emaciated body is merely an unending, echoing voice (φωνή ... ἄσπετος, *Hymn to Aphrodite* 237). In later sources, he is even transformed into a cicada (Callim. fr. 1.32–38 Pf.). Some interpreters regard these passages as evidence of an attempted conciliatory end, according to which Tithonus continues to live, in a certain sense, as a singer. Cf. e.g. Geissler (2005) esp. 111–112; Janko (2005); Rawles (2006a) 5–7; Livrea (2007) 72, 78–79.

Eos, just as the speaking 'I' in fr. 16 also stands in relation to Helen. Both are active as female subjects, and travel away over the sea for love. Helen also embodies the aspect of Eos-Aotis in Sparta.<sup>45</sup> She is the symbol of the young girl being initiated on the eve of her wedding. Like Helen, Eos embodies an aspect of Aphrodite: both go to the East motivated by an insatiable longing and enjoy themselves in bed with a Trojan youth.<sup>46</sup>

Like Eos, Sappho loves radiant young bodies. She takes pleasure in the dancing girls, and burns with desire for them. Moreover, she carries them away on artistic wings to the limits of the unconscious, into the pastures of the night, of dreams, and of a perfect aesthetics. The poetess even crosses the threshold of death, sinks like Eos into the tides, into the ocean of love, and draws out of it ever new love and youth. Eos has her 'house and dancing places' (*Odyssey* 12.3–4) in Aiaia,<sup>47</sup> at the edge of the earth where the sun rises. The image of the  $\chi\rho\rho\acute{\iota}$  (*Odyssey* 12.4) is probably very concrete: the sexually attractive goddess indeed leads circles of dancers and takes members of the chorus into her house, just like Sappho. Eos is the chorus leader of the girls gathered around her, who symbolize the attendant stars. After she has indulged in a night of love, she dances in the early morning together with her companions. As the sun rises, Dawn shines increasingly upon them. In the course of the day, she becomes old, before recovering her youth in the underworld. From the journey through death, dreams, and the unconscious, she derives new energy. Eos is immortal as a chorus leader, and like Sappho she will continue to perform as a celebrity above and below the earth (see ΑΙ). Therefore, Sappho identifies herself constantly with the mythic personification of dawn, as well as with Aphrodite.<sup>48</sup>

At least in the later tradition, Sappho is associated with Aphrodite. The poetess and her model are united in their love for pretty youths such as Adonis and Phaon, whose pursuit is repeatedly depicted on vases. This ongoing pursuit is the emblem of the eternal perpetuation of love. The erotic poetics of Sappho precisely coincides with the logic of love as the discourse of absence, as defined by Roland Barthes.<sup>49</sup> It is a matter of the imaginative quest for the object of

45 Cf. Alc. *PMGF* 1.87 (cf. also her possibly additional name of Orthria, line 61), and Calame (1977) II 122–127.

46 On fr. 16 v. and Helen, cf. Bierl (2003) 106–111.

47 On Aia (and Aiaia) as the country of Eos, cf. West (2007). On the dances of Eos, cf. Zusanek (2005) 87–88, 138.

48 With Eos: Sappho fr. 103, 123, 157, possibly 6 v.; with Aphrodite: among others, Sappho fr. 1, 2 v.; on the dive from the Leucadian cliffs, T 23 Campbell = Strabo 10.2.9. On the parallelism Eos-Aphrodite, cf. Nagy (1990) 246–250.

49 Barthes (1979) 13–17.

desire in which limitations can be overcome through music, poetry, and other aesthetic expressions. Sappho thus moves in imagination through the sphere of death, which is reflected in concrete terms in her aging body, in order then through the sphere of music and love to obtain youth once more.<sup>50</sup>

This exact configuration is displayed on a red-figure *oinokhoë* by the Achilles Painter dated ca. 470–460 BC and found in Vulci (Louvre G438). Eos, as a tall, mighty and winged figure is shown running after Tithonus, her human lover. She is stretching her hand towards the much smaller man, who looks back at her while running away with big steps and carrying in his left hand a lyre. These are the mental images and cultural associations which the recipient has in mind when she/he listens to the oral performance in the Sapphic circle or to ongoing reperformances in different venues and contexts at a later stage. Through visualization the meaning of the poem or of a series of thematically concatenated songs is configured in the act of perception.

Consistently with the approach of the Hellenistic tradition and the new contextualization, the outcome of the story in the new papyrus remains open. It suggests the rejuvenation of Eos and Tithonus, and the continuing performance of music and dance. The deferral to the next poem on Orpheus also reflects to some extent the erotic poetics, the ongoing gap of absence between pursuing lover and the hunted object of desire, and the technique of thematic allusions. The abrupt ending of the myth allows reflection on the subjects of *eros*, life after death or immortality, renewal, and music. The cyclic poetics of suspension and permanent deferral is manifested in the antithetical juxtaposition with the possibility of renewal. Sappho finds new energy in her attention to the dancing girls, who find a counterpart in Eos and her choruses. The poetess may be old, yet in her enthusiasm for youth and in her appreciation of their glowing bodies, she can always overcome age. At the same time, in the primary reception within her circle, the pedagogical function that resides precisely within *khoreia* assumes an important role.<sup>51</sup> Eos' marriage is reflected in the situation of the young women who are being prepared for marriage. Sappho can also give them the message that both they and their future husbands will grow old. Through the later recollection of their shared activities, above all in dance and music, and through a continued devotion to beauty and aesthetics, they can remain beautiful and young in spirit—and thus also desirable. By reperforming the same songs, Sappho and the girls of whom she sings can

50 Cf. Nagy (1990) 260–262 and (2009); cf. also Gronewald and Daniel (2004a) 3; Nagy (2007).

51 Cf. Bierl (2001) (in English, Bierl [2009]) Index s.v. 'Chor/sozialer Ort der Altersgenossinnen vor der Ehe', 'Erziehung', 'παίδεια'. On Sappho, cf. Calame (1977) 1 400–404 (in English, Calame [1997] 231–233); Ingalls (2000) 12–14; Bierl (2003) 100–123; Hardie (2005) 16, 27–32.



preserve their virginal freshness. As long as the song is performed, it remains current, being performed by ever new figures: an elderly chorus leader instructs in dance young girls who continuously leave the group and are replaced by others. It is precisely in this way that Sappho lives on, even after she is dead.<sup>52</sup> Thus she anticipates metapoetically her own literary success.

The song is influenced by other laments on old age, but is in itself not at all such a lament. An emotional outburst of such feelings would, in fact, have been ineffective and counterproductive within Sappho's circle.<sup>53</sup> The composition is much more a pedagogical statement for the benefit of the young, aristocratic women in her group and a self-referential, poetic reflection against the foil of the girls' chorus.<sup>54</sup> The 'beautiful gifts of the Muses' serve as inspiration for the aesthetics of movement, whereby Sappho is in a sense the tenth Muse<sup>55</sup> who as chorus leader performs at the head of the dancing circle, the image of the group of Muses.<sup>56</sup> One remains ever beautiful when one orients oneself toward the beautiful. Sappho rejuvenates herself in exactly the same way as her παίδες.

The tone is optimistic and never melancholic or self-pitying. Naturally, the girl is at the same time confronted through the myth with the finitude of life and the *conditio humana*. Music and the social institution of the χορός are, however, intransient. In this way, every querulous thought about old age is overcome.

Alcman's famous *song PMGF* 26 could have provided the model here with another capturing image:<sup>57</sup>

οὐ μ' ἔτι, παρσενικαὶ μελιγάρυες ἰαρόφωνοι,  
γυῖα φέρην δύνανται· βάλει δὴ βάλει κηρύλος εἶην,

52 Cf. also Geissler (2005) 109–111; Rawles (2006a) 4–7.

53 Thus, Sappho's 'emphatic response "Nonetheless!"' which Latacz (2005) believes he can find in these lines is not warranted; similarly Preisshofen (1977) 56–64, esp. 64; Meyerhoff (1984) 187–198, esp. 194–196; Falkner (1995) 102–107; Tsomis (2001) 247–250, esp. 249. All of these interpretations assume that the last four lines of fr. 58 v., which are missing in the Cologne papyrus, belong to this poem.

54 For this reason, Schadewaldt's biographical interpretation ([1950] 157–161) is misplaced: 'Sappho ist alt geworden, jedenfalls so alt, daß sie, die so an Anmut und Jugend hing, die Dunkelheiten des Alters sehr empfand. Sie trauerte darüber in einigen ihrer Lieder ...' (157).

55 Plato, *To the Muses* = *Anth. Pal.* 9.506, Antip. Sid. 12 Gow-Page = *Anth. Pal.* 9.66; cf. the anonymous author of *Anth. Pal.* 9.571 and Gosetti-Murrayjohn (2006).

56 *Anth. Pal.* 9.189 (anonymous). Cf. also Battezzato (2003) esp. 36–42.

57 For the comparison, cf. Gronewald and Daniel (2004a) 7; Bernsdorff (2004) 33–34; Gronewald and Daniel (2007a) 9; Ferrari (2010) 198, on the Cologne Sappho 193–204.

ὄς τ' ἐπὶ κύματος ἄνθος ἄμ' ἀλκυόνεσσι ποτήται  
νηδεῆς ἦτορ ἔχων, ἀλιπόρφυρος ἰαρός ὄρνις.

No longer, girls, honey-toned and holy-voiced,  
can my limbs bear me. If only I were a kingfisher,  
who flies together with his mates, the halcyons, over the frothy crests of  
the waves  
with powerful courage, sea-coloured, holy bird.

In this poem, *khoreia* represents likewise the decisive image, which supports the real chorus (or rather the solo singer). The chorus leader is old and contemplates his circle of maidens. In erotic desire for the girls who sing and dance under his instruction, the *khoregos* places himself in the role of the kingfisher. Birds function as a typical metaphor and visual emblem for choral dance; their hovering and formation in a group is reminiscent of the movement of the group of dancers.<sup>58</sup> The 'I' nurses the wish to be joined as a kingfisher in flight with its mate. The kingfisher, as is well known, floats happily over the surface of the water and dives head first in a stabbing motion into the water in order to catch fish. This movement resembles the immersion of Eos and Helios into the water, and particularly Sappho's leap from the Leucadian cliffs.<sup>59</sup> From desire for the girls and their youth, the chorus leader, who as a lyre-playing man cannot join the circle of girls and who represents himself as no longer dancing, springs figuratively into the ocean, and thus into the realm of death and dreams, in pursuit of the object of his desire, which he can never capture. The bird is described as being sea-blue-mauve because in its diving it loses itself to a certain extent and becomes part of the sea. The erotic poetics of absence, the yearning for the other, thus finds its concrete expression.<sup>60</sup> As in the case of Sappho, the erotic relationship is based on reciprocity: the dancing maidens also long for the unattainable chorus leader.

The poetry of Sappho and Alcman's *Partheneia* expresses itself in mutual desire and inspiration, as well as in erotic rejuvenation. Sappho's poem, then,

58 Cf. also Eur. *IT* 1089–1152, esp. 1138–1152, where the chorus of Greek women, who serve as temple servants in Tauris, wish like a kingfisher to fly the radiant beams of the sun in order to be able to join the choruses at home, in which they had already danced as girls at weddings. The song begins with an allusion to the kingfisher.

59 Cf. sources and treatment by Nagy (1990) 223–233. On the Leucadian cliffs as boundary to death and the unconscious, cf. Hom. *Od.* 24.11.

60 On solar symbolism, Halcyone and Ceyx, and the Leucadian cliffs, cf. Levaniouk (1999) 119–126, with reference to Penelope.

is not simply a ‘correction’ of Mimnermus,<sup>61</sup> but the image of extreme old age is merely the pronouncement of the impossibility of choral and sexual union.

I present the text of poem T here once more with various forms of emphasis in color intended to draw particular attention to the central visually charged terms for dancing and age.<sup>62</sup>

- ὔμμες κατὰ Μοῖσαν ἰ]οκ[ό]λπων κάλα δῶρα, παῖδες,  
 ὄρχησθε τε καὶ τὰ]γ φιλάιδον λιγύραν χελύναν·  
 ἔμοι δ' ἄπαλον πρίν] ποτ' [ἔ]οντα χροά γήρας ἤδη  
 ἐπέλλαβε, λευκαὶ δ' ἐγ]έροντο τρίχες ἐκ μελαίναν·  
 5 βάρυς δέ μ' ὀ [θ]ῦμος πεπόηται, γόνα δ' [ο]ὐ φέροισι,  
 τὰ δὴ ποτα λαίψηρ' ἔον ὄρχησθ' ἴσα νεβρίοισι.  
 ζὰ τὰ στεναχίσδω θαμέως· ἀλλὰ τί κεν ποεῖην;  
 ἀγήραον ἄνθρωπον ἔοντ' οὐ δύνατον γένεσθαι.  
 καὶ γάρ π[ο]τ'α Τίθωνον ἔφαντο βροδόπαχυ Αὔων  
 10 ἔρωι δέμας εἶσαν βάμεν' εἰς ἔσχατα γὰς φέροισα[ν],  
 ἔοντα [κ]άλλον καὶ νέον, ἀλλ' αὐτον ὕμωσ ἔμαρψε  
 χρόνῳ πρόλιον γήρας, ἔχ[ο]ντ' ἀθανάταν ἄκοιτιν.

1 vel ὕμμες παρὰ (vel περι, διὰ) Μοῖσαν φέρω τάδε Μοῖσαν Gronewald & Daniel γεραίρετε Μοῖσαν Di Benedetto Μοῖσαν ἐπιδείξασθ' Austin αἰ στέργετε Μοῖσαν Ferrari || 2 Bierl vel χορεύσατε καὶ vel νῦν (vel αὐ) παῖσδετε καὶ Bierl χορεύσατε κατ Di Benedetto λάβοισα πάλιν τὰν Gronewald & Daniel ἐλίσσετε κατ Ferrari ἐγέγρατέ τ' αὐ Austin πρέπει δὲ λάβην Di Benedetto || 3 ἔμοι δ' ἄπαλον πρίν Di Benedetto, prob. West κέκαρφ' ἄπαλον μοί Gronewald & Daniel || 4 West διώλεσε Di Benedetto || 7 Lundon || 10 ἔρωι δέμας εἶσαν Austin ἔρωι δέμας εἰσάνβαμεν' Gronewald & Daniel ἔρωι δέμας εἰσαμβάμεν' Livrea ἔρωι δὲ δάμεισαν Lieberg ἔρωι λαλάγεισαν βάμεν' Janko ἔρωι δέμα θείσαν Danielewicz ἔρωι ἄνι' ἄφεισαν Bettarini.

My translation of this passage is as follows:

You, girls, to the beautiful gifts of the violet-bosomed Muses,  
 dance, and to the song-loving, light-toned lyre.

61 Di Benedetto (1985) 157. On Tithonus, cf. Mimnermus fr. 4 w. = 1 Gentili-Prato, lines 1–2.

62 Cf. also text by Gronewald and Daniel (2004a) 4–5, and Gronewald and Daniel (2007a) 4–5, 7–8. The color red highlights choral self-referentiality; the color green dance and choral self-referentiality; the color blue old age and its qualities; the color brown qualities of youth.

Though old age has already overcome my body, once soft,  
 white has become my hair from black.  
 5 Heavy has my heart become, my knees carry no more,  
 which once were nimble to dance like deer.  
 Over this I sigh often. Yet what should I do?  
 Ageless as man one cannot become.  
 For it is said that once rosy-armed Eos,  
 10 to love her body surrendered, bore away Tithonus to the end of the  
 earth,  
 when he was beautiful and young. But grey old age overtook  
 him in time, though he had an immortal wife.

### The End of the 'Old Age Poem' (B)

An abrupt ending, such as we find in the Cologne papyrus, can readily be appreciated from a more modern, or even a Hellenistic, perspective. However, the four-line coda (B.1–4) would certainly have stood within its original context. In the primary didactic intention the return to the 'here and now'—the function of the poem within the circle of girls—assumes considerable importance.<sup>63</sup> We may consider my exposition of frs. 16 and 31 v.<sup>64</sup> In *P. Oxy.* 1787, fr. 1.22–25 and fr. 2.1, the original ending is still preserved. The last two lines of the coda (= fr. 58.23–26 v.) were already familiar in the indirect tradition preserved by Clearchus (in Athenaeus 15.687b). The much-discussed question of whether critical indications can clarify whether these lines belong to poem T remains open.<sup>65</sup> The single available piece of evidence is their content. I cite the four lines:

63 Cf. also Edmunds (2006) and (2009).

64 Cf. Bierl (2003) 120–122.

65 The left margin of *P. Oxy.* 1787, fr. 1 is lost, but for fr. 2, partially preserved. Here, there are traces of two *paragraphoi* after line 1 (= fr. 58.26 v.) and line 3 (= fr. 59.2 v.). There are no paleographical remains of a *coronis*. Lobel (1925) 26 introduces one; Lobel and Page (1963<sup>2</sup>) 42 place it in brackets (as a reconstructed lacuna); in Voigt (1971) 78 it appears again without brackets. Cf. Burzacchini (2007) 102–104, who concludes correctly that, in view of the condition of the material, the question remains open (104). West (2005) 3–4 justifies the separation of the coda on the grounds that there is no *coronis*—admittedly, the left margin of fr. 2 of *P. Oxy.* 1787 is so damaged that no certain interpretation is possible—and joins the verses to fr. 59 v. (= *P. Oxy.* 1787, fr. 2.2–4), thus forming a longer, but still fragmentary, poem (7–9). He is followed by Austin (2007) 120.

[ ]μέναν νομίσδει  
 [ ]αις ὀπάσδοι  
 25 ἔγω δὲ φίλημμ' ἄβροσύναν, ] τοῦτο καί μοι  
 τὸ λάμπρον ἔρος τῶελίω καὶ τὸ κάλον λέλλορχε.

..... [he/she] thinks  
 ..... might give  
 but I love delicacy ... [this and] love has obtained for me  
 the brightness and beauty of the sun.

as translated by Campbell; or, the last two lines in my translation,

But I love shining elegance, and you knew this, and  
 love of the sun has allowed me to share in its radiance and beauty.<sup>66</sup>

The four lines thus make explicit for the girls and the audience that which can only be imagined in the case of an open, abrupt ending. Like the famous priamel in fr. 16 v., the concluding lines could almost stand as a motto for Sappho's entire poetic oeuvre.<sup>67</sup> Sappho, or the lyric 'I', says as chorus leader that she loves shining elegance. In ἄβροσύνα, the recollection of the radiant, oriental beloved is preserved, whether Phaon, Adonis, or Tithonus.<sup>68</sup> In the original ending of the so-called 'old age poem', Sappho elucidates that she loves the beautiful from which radiance originates. In concrete terms, this means the girls. The chorus leader and the dancing maidens are reciprocally bound to one another, and each yearns for the other. Yet this passion is far removed from any direct sexual satisfaction. Sappho styles herself an old woman because she cannot and may not dance together with the girls as their equal. Of course she is older, but she is still captivated by the grace of the virginal, glowing bodies as they move in dance, from which a particular effect of grace and radiance

66 For a discussion of both possibilities, cf. Lardinois (2009) 43–44; Boedeker (2009) 72; Nagy (2009) 189–191, with a preference for 'love of the sun'. Cf. also Bierl (2008) ch. 5 n. 74; Buzzi et al. (2008) 41–42, 120–121.

67 Thus also Schadewaldt (1950) 161; Preisshofen (1977) 61.

68 Kurke (1992) interprets the word ἄβροσύνα (Attic ἄβροσύνη) not merely in material but also in political terms, in the sense of an aristocratic oriental luxury; on our passage, 93–99. Maehler's definition ([1963] 61) is comprehensive: 'Die Gesamtheit der Werte, die sie in der Gemeinschaft mit ihren Mädchen pflegte'. On ἄβρος, Sappho fr. 2.14 (Aphrodite), 128 (Charites), 44.7 (Andromache as bride), 140.1 (Adonis), 100 v. (cloth). Cf. also Buzzi et al. (2008) 126 n. 64.

proceeds. While Sappho sings enchantingly and accompanies herself on the lyre, the girls dance in graceful movement. The entire scene is pure aesthetics, perfect beauty. In a reperformance the speaker would have experienced this in the same manner. Finally, we come to the curious sentence to the effect that love of, that is, desire for the sun has won for her its brilliance and beauty. In her yearning for the highest beauty, concretized in the sun—here she almost anticipates Plato—she receives a share of it. Eos also acquired her radiance from the permanent devotion to the sun.

The solar dimension of the myth of Eos and Aphrodite, who both take oriental lovers, now becomes more apparent. This love can never really be fulfilled: one leaps after the ‘luminous’ in longing and erotic ecstasy in the realm of passion and fantasies. Sappho’s poetics conceives this desire for the absent one, whom one can never win, as an eternal postponement. In Sappho’s fr. 1.21 v., pursuit and flight are pinpointed: ‘And if she flees, she will soon pursue’. Within her circle, she chases and longs for the bodies of the girls. Through her desire for the physical, she achieves aesthetic satisfaction, just as the girls do in their relationship to her.<sup>69</sup> And on the famous picture of the Vulci *oinokhoe* discussed above, Sappho’s model Eos, to whom she refers in poem τ, is depicted precisely in the same posture of following after Tithonus, her object of erotic yearning.

Every girl who sings Sappho’s songs can identify with this motto, and through the emphasis on artistic perfection and synaesthetic harmony, each enjoys participation in it like Sappho. Beauty has an effect in turn on the girls’ radiance and sex appeal, which are necessary for marriage in an aristocratic *oikos*. And the sentence bears a potential to be transferred to male recipients in new contexts as well.

Last but not least, Sappho seems to evoke a mystical notion in the image of the sun. In the afterlife, one gazes at the radiant light, takes delight in blessed choruses, and lives on. Here, as in the context of the mysteries, there is a cosmic dimension. Does Sappho perhaps display evidence of early Orphic experiences, which came to the Greeks in this period from Asia Minor via Lesbos?<sup>70</sup> On the

69 On this poetics, cf. Yatromanolakis’ interpretation of the red-figure *kalyx* bowl of the Tithonus painter, 480–470 BC (Bochum, Ruhr-Universität, Kunstsammlungen, Inv. s 508), where on one side Sappho with a garment pursues a girl (with the inscription HE ΠΙΑΙΣ). Cf. Yatromanolakis (2001), (2005), (2007) 88–110. On the Cologne Sappho, cf. Yatromanolakis (2007) 203–205, 360 n. 341. Cf. also Nagy (2007) 233–265, (2009) 183–195.

70 I distance myself here decidedly from Böhme (1970) esp. 143–163 (with numerous, definitely imaginative examples of motifs): e.g. he associates (148) fr. 58 with the imagery of cicadas and their light-toned song (λιγυροῦν ... ἀοιδίην), as described by Hes. *Op.* 582–584,

Orphic-Bacchic gold leaves, light, radiance, Helios, the stars, and the heavens are often mentioned.<sup>71</sup> In mythology, Orpheus is himself often closely associated with Helios. The sun, the moon, and night assume a significant role in both Sappho's poetry and in Orphism, an importance which is now confirmed by the Derveni papyrus. In the hermeneutics of a possibly reform-oriented Orphic devotee, the sun is the central principle.<sup>72</sup> There it is placed on an equal footing with Uranus' phallus, which Zeus swallowed (col. 13; 16.1 K.-P.-T.). The sun is the highest principle (col. 13.12 K.-P.-T.). The explicit erotic statement of love of the sun in Sappho could be explained by such a context. Similarly, Phaon, the embodiment of the shining sun, is associated with Sappho's fascination with the phallus (Sappho fr. 211c v.).<sup>73</sup> In the Derveni papyrus, Helios is the principle of life,<sup>74</sup> the giver of life as encapsulated fire, which lends movement and stimulation. Precisely in the obscure gold leaf Thuri 2, 492 Bernabé, Helios and fire also stand at the center of the cosmic interchange (line 4), the reciprocal exchange of opposites, in a manner similar to the account of Heraclitus, who is in turn cited in the Derveni papyrus (col. 4 K.-P.-T.) and who is often associated with Orphic ideas.<sup>75</sup> The sight of the sun means simply life (Sappho fr. 56 and

---

with λιγυρόν χελύωνα (T.2). Turyn (1942) esp. 313–318 had already associated Sappho with Orphism, and combined the description of the *locus amoenus* on the Florentine ostraccon, Sappho fr. 2 v., with notions of paradise in Orphic eschatology, which in his opinion Sappho drew from Orpheus' poem Κατάβασις εἰς Ἄϊδου. Hardie (2005) presents concepts derived from Orphism similar to those offered here.

- 71 Cf. the leaf from Petelia, ca. 350 BC, 476 Bernabé, lines 6–7: 'A child of the earth am I and of the starry heavens / but I have a divine descent ...'; cf. similarly the Thessalian lamella of unknown provenance 484 Bernabé, lines 3–4, and the leaf from Pharsalos 477 Bernabé, lines 8–9 (where the second part is replaced by 'my name is "star-like", *Asterios*). On the first part, cf. the lamellae from Rethymnon 484a Bernabé, line 3; from Mylopotamos 481 Bernabé, line 3; from Eleutherna 478, 479, 480, 482, 483 Bernabé, line 3; and from Hipponion 474 Bernabé, line 10.
- 72 Cf. e.g. Most (1997); West (1997); Tsantsanoglou (1997) 98–99, 117; Betegh (2004) esp. 349–372. Cf. Bierl (2014).
- 73 Fr. 211c v. = Pliny *HN* 22.20 (on sea holly, *Eryngium maritimum*): *portentosum est quod de ea (sc. erynge) traditur, radicem eius alterutrius sexus similitudinem referre, raro inventu, sed si viris contigerit mas, amabilis fieri; ob hoc et Phaonem Lesbium dilectum a Sappho*. According to this story, Phaon became particularly attractive sexually because he found a root of sea holly which resembled the phallus, and thus Sappho fell so deeply in love with him.
- 74 On the notion of the vision of the sun as the expression of life, cf. Hom. *Il.* 24.558 and Sappho fr. 56 v. The indirect source of Clearchus (fr. 41 Wehrli), preserved by Athenaeus 15.687b, where the quotation occurs, has as explanation of 'love of the sun' ἡ τοῦ ζῆν ἐπιθυμία.
- 75 For more Orphic parallels, cf. Bierl (2008) ch. 5.

65 v.; *Iliad* 24.558), to which the highest significance is ascribed, as in the relevant passage of our poem. Likewise, in view of the epithets denoting radiance, Eos assumes an important role in the extant fragments of Sappho (fr. 6, 103, 104a, 123, 157, 175 v.).

The last four lines, extant only in *P. Oxy.* 1787, thus lend depth to this assertion. The context, however, does not necessarily have to do with consolation or with a farewell to youth and beauty, themes conventionally read into many of Sappho's fragments.<sup>76</sup> Rather, these verses expand the statement to a philosophical and aesthetic level. Love of the sun and devotion to radiance imply a poetics both of loss and of deferral. It is never possible to possess the beloved entirely for oneself; one can only aspire to this. Sappho's song is completely indebted to the poetics of Eros, the eternal discourse of Barthesian absence.<sup>77</sup> In the pursuit of the erotic object and the sun, she herself obtains through her erotic Muse a share in beauty and radiance, by means of which she is continuously renewed and rejuvenated. With the help of the Muses and what is beautiful, death and old age can be overcome.

### Orpheus and the New Section (o) of an Anonymous Lyric Poem

The section that is included in view of its thematic association, but which is certainly not to be ascribed to Sappho, remains something of a riddle in its fragmentary condition.

ψιθυροπλόκε δόλιξε μύθων αὐτοῦγ[(έ)  
 ἐπίβουλε παῖ [[βοτο.]] [. ] ' . . γε ' [...] αχ[. .]. [  
 ἐταίρε ἀφέρπω: δ[  
 [. ] . . . . . . . . . . : (?) . . [  
 5 [. ] . . γ : (?) ἄπρους πρ . [  
 [φ]ῶς ἀστέρων τε[  
 [τ]ὸ πυριφεγγὲς ἀελ[  
 [. ] . πᾶς ἀκούω: θ . . [ Οἰά- ]  
 [γ]ρου κόρον Ὀρφέα χ[  
 10 [έρ]πετὰ πάντα κ[

76 Cf. Lardinois (2009) 51–53; he situates the song in the context of the wedding, where Sappho playfully contrasts herself with the youthful bloom of the bride and the groom. At the same time, it perhaps contains a warning for the happy pair, that they, too, will one day become old.

77 Barthes (1979) 13–17.



[. . .]. τὰν ἐρατὰν λα[  
 [εὔ]φθογγον λύραν. . . [  
 [συ]νεργὸν ἔχοισα π. . .]

Chirping-whispering, slander-weaving, sly, inventor of stories  
 malicious boy ...  
 friend, I am going away/crawl away

...

- 5 dead/breathless  
 light of the stars and  
 [the radiance], the fire-glowing, the sun  
 completely I hear. ... Oia-  
 gros' son Orpheus [bewitching  
 10 all the animals [and stones]  
 the enchanting [taken up with hands  
 the fine-sounding lyre  
 as a help having [completely]<sup>78</sup>

The first editors, Gronewald and Daniel, regarded the text as belonging to the 'erotic theme', particularly given the allusion to Sappho's fr. 1 and to Eros at the beginning.<sup>79</sup> Rawles, on the other hand, related the text to Hermes because of the epithets,<sup>80</sup> and thus to music and life after death, although these two motifs also constitute an association with Sappho's songs. I consider all of these three subjects, which also characterize Sappho, to be present: love, self-referential poetic reflection with regard to music, and notions of life after death. The presence of these motifs supports the thesis of an anthology that might have been composed for reperformance in symposia or for recital on other occasions. Love and lamentations, reflections about music, and general questions about life, old age, death, and the afterlife are certainly prominent themes here, and when such songs were removed from their original context, they could have been arranged as extracts according to these themes.<sup>81</sup>

78 Text (= *P. Köln* col. II.9–21) following Gronewald and Daniel (2005) 9 and (2007b) 15–16. On the fragment, cf. also Rawles (2006b); Lundon (2007) esp. 154–166; Puglia (2008); Clayman (2009).

79 Gronewald and Daniel (2005) 8.

80 Rawles (2006b): ψιθυριστής Dem. 59.39; δόλιος Ar. *Thesm.* 1202.

81 We can only speculate about other possible occasions in which they may have been performed, for example, at informal gatherings, or those of intellectuals or Orphic initiates. In

Gronewald and Daniel structure the anonymous poem as follows:<sup>82</sup> a long address to a 'youth' and 'friend' (1–3), a part which speaks of the 'light of the stars' and 'the fire-glowing ... sun' (6–7), after which Orpheus is mentioned (9), to which is added a reference to a woman who plays her lyre as well as Orpheus did (11–13). The first editors emphasize that these lines connect smoothly with the end of A1.10–11 (CS col. i.10–11) and the prelude of T.1–2 (CS col. i.12–13). Orpheus matches the motifs and mental images in T very closely. He is the mythical musician who crossed the threshold of death, and with his singing even mesmerized the underworld in order to win back his beloved. Yet, in spite of his legendary musical skill, he is doomed to fail, as the *conditio humana* and the poetics of *eros* oppose any possibility of success. Following his brutal death by mutilation, his head, borne on the waves to Lesbos, sings on. The principles of selection and arrangement of this collection thus consist in self-referential reflection of the singer and lyre player, the overcoming of death, erotic pursuit, magical bewitching, the endless deferral of the unattainable object of desire, sublimation in the continuation of the personal lament through music even beyond one's own death, and especially the Lesbian musical tradition.

Gronewald and Daniel suspected a 'change of speaker or singer' on the basis of the two obvious *dicola* after ἀφέρπω (3) and ἀκούω (8); two more in lines 4 and 5 are much less certain. In their opinion, there would have been both a woman and a man, perhaps Sappho and Phaon, or Sappho and Alcaeus (cf. Sappho fr. 137 v.), as in a theatrical dialogue.<sup>83</sup> Perhaps Sappho was also performed dramatically like Homer. The woman reproaches the man and is about to leave, whereupon the man responds with an oath 'by the sun (, moon,) and stars' and insists that he wants to listen. The woman then begins her song, like Orpheus. Gronewald and Daniel are nonetheless aware of the *dicolon's* ambiguity and note that it could equally well have been used merely as punctuation, as in the mimetic poem 'The Girl's Lament' (*P. Grenf.* 11 = *P. Lond. Lit.* 50 = *P. Dryton* 50).<sup>84</sup> It is therefore possible to interpret the song as a female solo, while πᾶς, as the only male form which might appear to contradict this view, can also be construed as πᾶσ'. The *Fragmentum Grenfellianum* is also relevant in view of its contents, as Gronewald and Daniel recognized. The parallels

---

view of the non-definitive form of the text (casual hand, corrections and improvements), London (2007) 160 and Puglia (2008) 16–17 regard it as an early poetic attempt on a still blank part of the papyrus.

82 Gronewald and Daniel (2005) 8.

83 Gronewald and Daniel (2005) 8 with n. 5.

84 CA 177–180 Powell. A new critical edition by Elena Esposito has appeared, which refers to this fragment: Esposito (2005) 11, 61, 101, 105, 111, 123.

considered by Lundon and Puglia are even more striking.<sup>85</sup> The monologue of an abandoned woman who addresses herself characterizes both texts. Lundon adds as a further parallel the monody from *P. Tebt.* 11, in which Helen, left alone by Menelaus, compares the happy past to the present in a long lament.<sup>86</sup>

Rawles views the two responses, emphasized through the *dicola* in lines 3 and 8, less literally and only as ‘verbal markers’ of a change of speaker, in the sense of ‘your turn,’ so that one speaker follows the other antiphonally.<sup>87</sup> In his opinion, the song of the two musicians presents the mythical history of the lyre from its invention by Hermes to Apollo and Orpheus.

Let us consider the various suggested solutions, of which I prefer the interpretation as a monody by a girl.

A female singer or speaker invokes Eros or Hermes (1–2) in the form of a prelude. Rawles takes the crossed-out βοτο (2, grazing animals, with reference to the Homeric *Hymn to Hermes*) as supporting his argument in favor of Hermes.<sup>88</sup> The female speaker sings a continuous, monodic lament. With παῖ (2) she emphatically addresses a beloved person. The vocative also establishes a connection with *paides* in T.1 = CS 9. The speaker perhaps despairs that he is unattainable. According to Rawles (2006b) 9, ἑτάριε, ‘friend’ (3) could not be identical with the addressee of παῖ (1–2), but must rather address the fellow performer: for example, ‘Now it’s your turn, friend, I am going off stage.’ Another alternative would be to take all the vocatives as the addressee of the abandoned lover, who is well-skilled in the arts of love in composing flatteries and inventing lies.<sup>89</sup>

ἄπνουσ then takes up the situation of death.<sup>90</sup> We have already mentioned the sun, the moon, and the stars. However, as Gronewald and Daniel also note,

85 Lundon (2007) 162–163; Puglia (2008).

86 Puglia (2008) also accepts this possibility and attempts a purely monodic reconstruction.

87 Rawles (2006b) 9.

88 Rawles (2006b) 10.

89 Thus also Puglia (2008) 13. Βοτο might also be an allusion to the comparison of young girls with horses (cf. Alc. *PMGF* 1.47, ἐν βοτοῖς στάσειεν ἵππων). The scene might occur in an idyllic grove as in Sappho fr. 2 v., where animals and particularly horses graze (cf. λείμων ἱπτόβοτος). The scribe may have omitted something, written only βοτο mechanically and then seen his mistake, or did he intend to write, for example, βροτο in the sense of ἐν βροτοῖσι? Puglia (2008) 13 now believes it is possible to read β' ἴ' στογ in the papyrus instead of βοτογ. At the end of line 2, we could perhaps emend κ]ακ[έ. ἀφέρπω (3) would then be interpreted as ‘I am going away’, i.e., in death (elliptically εἰς Ἄιδου οἶκον). δ[αμείσ' ἔρωτι is perhaps to be emended.

90 Cf. Leonidas, *Anth. Pal.* 7.652.6; Dioscurides, *Anth. Pal.* 7.299.1; further references in Gronewald and Daniel (2005) 11.

this is not merely an oath on the planets but also a reference to the life that one is forsaking.<sup>91</sup> In place of a connection with the object, a new sentence might begin here along the following lines: ‘I love the light of the stars and the moon and the fire-glowing rays of the sun’, emended thus: [φ]ῶς ἀστέρων τε [σελάνας φιλῆμμι or φιλῶ καὶ / [τ]ῶ πυριφεγγές ἀελ[ίοιο σέλας (6–7).

‘I am listening completely’ (8) is translated by Gronewald and Daniel as ‘I am all ears’, while Rawles once more takes it as a bridge to the next singer.<sup>92</sup> In *scriptio continua*, πᾶς must be understood as πᾶσ’. The lamenting girl would then, listening in her totality, be referring to something. The question then arises as to what the object of this action is. Is it “you” (informal), that is, a conversation partner, or Eros, or perhaps Hermes, who gives her instructions or sings himself? Or does it refer to the aforementioned cosmic, visual phenomena, which in a way sound a harmony of the spheres? Puglia wants to employ ἀνάτιο]ς πᾶσ’ here and considers as possible objects in the situation of abandonment such things as ψόγους, μέμψεις, or διαβολάς.<sup>93</sup> The neutral attribute πυριφεγγές (7), attested only in Orphic and magical literature, would effectively indicate the magical ‘transition to Orpheus’<sup>94</sup> and mark the passage from the act of seeing the radiant heavenly manifestations to that of hearing. The singer again turns to the cosmos, like Sappho in T and B.1–4, and focuses on the radiant and aesthetically beautiful. With the *dicolon*, as in line 3, the asyndetically added sudden reaction is once more emphasized: ‘the Thracian youth Orpheus, Oiaeros’ son, imitating<sup>95</sup> ... who with his song mesmerizes<sup>96</sup> all the animals (and stones) (καὶ λίθους), I take the sweet, fine-sounding lyre in my hands (λά[βοισα χερσί), and have it completely as my helper.’<sup>97</sup>

91 Gronewald and Daniel (2005) 11, (2007b) 18. With reference to Praxilla *PMG* 747.1–2 (the words of the dying Adonis), κάλλιστον μὲν ἐγὼ λείπω φῶς ἠελίοιο, / δεύτερον ἄστρα φαεινὰ σεληναίης τε πρόσωπον, Gronewald and Daniel (2005) 11 emend ἄπνους προ[λείπω or προ[λίπομι. As Adonis is speaking here, the references to the cosmos have a deeper significance than a mere poetic euphemism for death. It would be possible to take προ[λείπω here as absolute, or to emend with προ[λείπω βίον, ‘I am dying’. Puglia (2008) 15 reports that Ferrari considered here the emendation πρὸ [θυρῶν ἔστηκα.

92 Gronewald and Daniel (2005) 9; Rawles (2006b) 9.

93 Puglia (2008) 14.

94 Gronewald and Daniel (2005) 11.

95 I follow the suggestion of Gronewald and Daniel (2005) 11, Θρη[ίτικον μιμουμένα. Puglia (2008) 15 emends, however, suitable for the lament of the girl, θρη[νοισα μιμουμένα.

96 Cf. Gronewald and Daniel (2005) 12, κ[ηλούντα (ἀοιδάι).

97 Puglia (2008) 15 prefers to take ἐρατᾶν as referring not to the lyre but to Eurydice (see below n. 98). After [συ]νεργὸν ἔχοισα he emends πᾶν[των πόνων ἐμῶν.

The poetics of the Hellenistic song captures the visual in a rather different manner compared to Sappho. Whereas the archaic poetess builds her pedagogical utterances on evident and iconic scenes, which are based on common imagery as well as cultural patterns and concepts—I mean the playing of the lyre in the underworld, the accompaniment of blessed choruses, physical decay on the foil of young maidens engaged in chorality, and the cycle of the sun as hope for rejuvenation—the Hellenistic poem focuses on the real experience of extenuating love and on a concrete image of Orpheus who enchants nature and thus provides hope for the afterlife. Moreover, the last poem is rather dramatic, as dialogue or melodramatic expression of lament by a single person. All cosmic images and the myth of Orpheus seem to be deployed in a specific narrative context which because of the fragmentary status of the lines is almost impossible to reconstruct, and not, like in Sappho's previous songs, in function of a didactic message to be conveyed in the lyric situation of reflection and persuasion.

### Conclusion

Like Orpheus, who as singer and lyre player *par excellence* in the underworld and on earth bewitches everything with his song, so the girl who embodies Sappho as singer in the Hellenistic reperformance sings and captivates us, perhaps even as she enchants Eros or the beloved youth. Yet even so, through her song she will never obtain the object of her desire; rather, love finds its expression only in the form of a lament. Eros is needed in order to inspire others to dance or to charm them through the musical performance. The singer is dead, or at least feels herself to be, yet continues to sing of love, just as Orpheus and Sappho did. Death can be associated in turn with old age. Through song and her focus on the cosmos, she will again become young.

The mention of Orpheus lends additional confirmation to the metapoetic and self-referential reading of Sappho's new poem τ. The girl in ο almost becomes a Muse, who in a context of cosmic choral performance attains immortality in harmony with the planets, and much the same occurs with Sappho. Death, night, lament, love, song, music, and the cosmos—in short, all that Orphism represents—are the decisive themes that unite the fragments.<sup>98</sup>

98 Di Benedetto (2005) 12–13 assumes that the story of Eurydice is mentioned in Α2, the section preceding τ in fr. *P. Oxy.* 1787, of which little is extant. Admittedly, we can only

Orpheus embraces in his cosmogonies above all the construction of harmony, resolution of conflict, and a balancing of opposites. On the other hand, lamentation and loss are prominent in the erotic poetics.

The deferral of love becomes its own song in the interruption and continuation of a reperformance. It is only in the anthological combination that a unity occurs which makes Eros dependent upon the artistic production of song. Even the interest in a further existence in the afterlife, which is usually the object of the mystery cults, is associated with the projection of the continued performance of music in the afterlife. The original pedagogical-didactic reception gives way to secondary receptions, determined by changing occasions of reperformance. In the fourth century BC the new performative practice even showcases a Hellenistic cult of poets and metapoetic self-consciousness. Cyclic rejuvenation and the erotic poetics of desire and absence are more constitutive than ever. Through their deep visualizing power Sappho's songs have lived on indeed, even until they have reached us today.

We have seen that Sappho builds her poetic discourse in the Cologne Papyrus on very specific cultural and visual patterns which, through mental imagery, help to shape cognitive reception, particularly in oral performance contexts. Sappho draws on images and concepts of chorality and mythic dancing in a solar context. As cultural symbols they are in service to highlight the unifying themes of beauty, poetic and musical self-referentiality, and rejuvenation.

### Works Cited

- Alexiou, M. (2002). *After Antiquity. Greek Language, Myth, and Metaphor*. Ithaca.
- Austin, C. (2007). 'Nuits chaudes à Lesbos: Buvons avec Alcée, aimons avec Sappho' in Bastianini and Casanova (eds) (2007): 115–126.
- Barthes, R. (1979). *A Lover's Discourse. Fragments* (transl. R. Howard). London.
- Bastianini, G. and Casanova, A. (eds) (2007). *I papiri di Saffo e di Alceo. Atti del convegno internazionale di studi, Firenze, 8–9 giugno 2006*. Studi e Testi di Papirologia N.S. 9. Florence.
- Battezzato, L. (2003). 'Song, performance, and text in the new Posidippus'. *ZPE* 145: 31–43.

---

speculate about the context by means of the reconstructed forms φ]ύγοισα and δάχθην (fr. 58.5–6 v.). He also perceives in the few letters of fr. 58.7 v. a reference to Orpheus' mother Calliope, [K]αλλ[ί]οπα.

- Bernsdorff, H. (2004). 'Schwermut des Alters im neuen Kölner Sappho-Papyrus'. *ZPE* 150: 27–35.
- (2005). 'Offene Gedichtschlüsse'. *ZPE* 153: 1–6.
- Betegh, G. (2004). *The Derveni Papyrus. Cosmology, Theology and Interpretation*. Cambridge.
- Bierl, A. (2001). *Der Chor in der Alten Komödie. Ritual und Performativität (unter besonderer Berücksichtigung von Aristophanes' Thesmophoriazusen und der Phalloslieder fr. 851 PMG)*. Munich. Revised English edition = Bierl (2009).
- (2003). "Ich aber (sage), das Schönste ist, was einer liebt!" Eine pragmatische Deutung von Sappho Fr. 16 LP/V.'. *QUCC* 103: 91–124.
- (2008). 'Der neue Sappho-Papyrus aus Köln und Sapphos Erneuerung. Virtuelle Choralität, Eros, Tod, Orpheus und Musik', electronic publication on the CHS website <http://chs.harvard.edu/CHS/article/display/2122>.
- (2009). *Ritual and Performativity. The Chorus in Old Comedy* (transl. A. Hollmann). Cambridge, MA.
- (2010). 'Sappho in Athens. Reperformance and performative contextualizations of the new Cologne papyrus, or old age and rejuvenation through chorality', electronic publication on the *Athens Dialogues*-website <http://athensdialogues.chs.harvard.edu/cgi-bin/WebObjects/athensdialogues.woa/wa/dist?dis=36>.
- (2014). "Riddles over riddles:" Mysterious and symbolic (inter)textual strategies' in I. Papadopoulou and L. Muellner (eds), *Poetry as Initiation. The Center for Hellenic Studies Symposium on the Derveni Papyrus*. Cambridge, MA and London: 187–210, electronic version on the CHS website <http://chs.harvard.edu/CHS/article/display/5694>.
- Boedeker, D. (forthcoming). 'Sappho old and new (P.Köln 21351 and 21376, and P.Oxy. 1787): An overview of texts and contexts' in A. Pierris (ed.), *Symposium Lesbium: Poetry, Wisdom and Politics in Archaic Lesbos: Alcaeus, Sappho, Pittacus*. Oxford.
- (2009). 'No way out? Aging in the new (and old) Sappho' in Greene and Skinner (eds) (2009): 71–83.
- Boehringer, S. (2013). "Je suis Tithon, je suis Aurore": performance et érotisme dans le 'nouveau' fr. 58 de Sappho'. *QUCC* 133: 23–44.
- Böhme, R. (1970). *Orpheus. Der Sänger und seine Zeit*. Bern.
- Bühler, K. (1934). *Sprachtheorie. Die Darstellungsfunktion der Sprache*. Jena.
- Burzacchini, G. (2007). 'Saffo Fr. 1, 2, 58 v. Tra documentazione papiracea e tradizione indiretta' in Bastianini and Casanova (eds) (2007): 83–114.
- Buzzi, S. et al. (2008). *Nuove acquisizioni di Saffo e della lirica greca. Per il testo di P. Köln inv. 21351 + 21376 e P. Oxy. 1787* (ed. A. Aloni). Alessandria.
- Calame, C. (1977). *Les chœurs de jeunes filles en Grèce archaïque, 1: Morphologie, fonction religieuse et sociale. 11: Alcman*. Rome. Revised English edition of vol. 1 = Calame (1997).

- (1997). *Choruses of Young Women in Ancient Greece: Their Morphology, Religious Role, and Social Function* (transl. D. Collins and J. Orion). Lanham, MD.
- (1998). 'Éros revisité: La subjectivité discursive dans quelques poèmes grecs'. *Uranie* 8 (= *Figures d'Éros*): 95–107.
- (2013). 'La poésie de Sappho aux prises avec le genre: polyphonie, pragmatique et rituel (à propos du fr. 58b)'. *QUCC* 133: 45–67.
- Clayman, D. (2009). 'The New Sappho in a Hellenistic poetry book' in Greene and Skinner (eds) (2009): 131–146.
- Denis, M. (1991). *Image and Cognition*. New York.
- Di Benedetto, V. (1985). 'Il tema della vecchiaia e il fr. 58 di Saffo'. *QUCC* 48: 145–163.
- (2004). 'Osservazioni sul nuovo papiro di Saffo'. *ZPE* 149: 5–6.
- (2005). 'La nuova Saffo e dintorni'. *ZPE* 153: 7–20.
- (2006). 'Il tetrastico di Saffo e tre postille'. *ZPE* 155: 5–18.
- duBois, P. (1995). *Sappho Is Burning*. Chicago.
- Edmunds, L. (2006). 'The New Sappho: ΕΦΑΝΤΟ (9)'. *ZPE* 156: 23–26.
- (2009). 'Tithonus in the "New Sappho" and the narrated mythical exemplum in archaic Greek poetry' in Greene and Skinner (eds) (2009): 58–70.
- Esposito, E. (2005). *Il Fragmentum Grenfellianum (P. Dryton 50)*. Bologna.
- Falkner, T.M. (1995). *The Poetics of Old Age in Greek Epic, Lyric, and Tragedy*. Norman, OK.
- Fernandez, J.W. (ed.) (1986). *Persuasions and Performances. The Play of Tropes in Culture*. Bloomington.
- (1991). *Beyond Metaphor. The Theory of Tropes in Anthropology*. Stanford.
- Ferrari, F. (2010). *Sappho's Gift. The Poet and Her Community* (transl. B. Acosta-Hughes and L. Prauscello). Ann Arbor.
- Ferrari, G. (2002). *Figures of Speech. Men and Maidens in Ancient Greece*. Chicago.
- Finke, R.A. (1989). *Principles of Mental Imagery*. Cambridge, MA.
- Foley, J.M. (1999). *Homer's Traditional Art*. University Park, PA.
- Gallavotti, C. (1962<sup>3</sup>). *Saffo e Alceo: Testimonianze e frammenti*, I: *Saffo*. Naples.
- Geissler, C. (2005). 'Der Tithonosmythos bei Sappho und Kallimachos. Zu Sappho fr. 58 v., 11–22 und Kallimachos, Aitia fr. 1 Pf.'. *GFA* 8: 105–114.
- Gentili, B. (1984). *Poesia e pubblico nella Grecia antica da Omero al V secolo*. Rome. English edition = Gentili (1988).
- (1988). *Poetry and Its Public in Ancient Greece. From Homer to the Fifth Century* (transl. A.T. Cole). Baltimore.
- (2006a). *Lo spettacolo nel mondo antico. Teatro greco e teatro romano arcaico*. New revised ed. Rome.
- (2006b). *Poesia e pubblico nella Grecia antica da Omero al V secolo*. New revised fourth ed. Rome.
- Gentili, B. and C. Catenacci. (2007). 'Saffo "politicamente corretta"'. *QUCC* 115: 79–87.



- Gosetti-Murrayjohn, A. (2006). 'Sappho as the tenth Muse in Hellenistic epigram'. *Arethusa* 39: 21–45.
- Greene, E. (ed.). (1996). *Reading Sappho. Contemporary Approaches*. Berkeley.
- Greene, E. (2009). 'Sappho 58. Philosophical reflections on death and aging' in Greene and Skinner (eds) (2009): 147–161.
- Greene, E. and M.B. Skinner (eds) (2009). *The New Sappho on Old Age: Textual and Philosophical Issues*. Hellenic Studies 38. Washington, DC.
- Gronewald, M. and R.W. Daniel (2004a). 'Ein neuer Sappho-Papyrus'. *ZPE* 147: 1–8.
- (2004b). 'Nachtrag zum neuen Sappho-Papyrus'. *ZPE* 149: 1–4.
- (2005). 'Lyrischer Text (Sappho-Papyrus)'. *ZPE* 154: 7–12.
- (2007a). 'Griechische Literarische Texte: 429. Sappho' in C. Armoni et al. (eds), *Kölner Papyri (P. Köln)* XI. Papyrologica Coloniensia VII. Paderborn: 1–11.
- (2007b). '430. Lyrischer Text (Sappho-Papyrus)' in C. Armoni et al. (eds), *Kölner Papyri (P. Köln)* XI. Papyrologica Coloniensia VII. Paderborn: 12–19.
- Hamm, E.-M. (1957). *Grammatik zu Sappho und Alkaios*. Berlin.
- Hardie, A. (2004). 'Muses and mysteries' in P. Murray and P. Wilson (eds), *Music and the Muses. The Culture of "Mousikê" in the Classical Athenian City*. Oxford: 11–37.
- (2005). 'Sappho, the Muses, and life after death'. *ZPE* 154: 13–32.
- Hölscher, U. (1965). 'Selbstgespräch' in *Die Chance des Unbehagens. Zur Situation der klassischen Studien*. Göttingen: 53–86.
- Ingalls, W.B. (2000). 'Ritual performance as training for daughters in archaic Greece'. *Phoenix* 54: 1–20.
- Iser, W. (1976). *Der Akt des Lesens. Theorie ästhetischer Wirkung*. Munich.
- Janko, R. (2005). 'Sappho revisited'. *TLS* 5360 (23/12/2005): 19–20.
- Kosslyn, S.M. et al. (2006). *The Case for Mental Imagery*. Oxford.
- K.-P.-T. = T. Kouremenos, T., G.M. Parássoglou, and K. Tsantsanoglou (eds), *The Derveni Papyrus. Edited with Introduction and Commentary*. Florence 2006.
- Kurke, L. (1992). 'The politics of ἀβροσύνη in archaic Greece'. *ClAnt* 11: 91–120.
- Lardinois, A. (1994). 'Subject and circumstance in Sappho's poetry'. *TAPhA* 124: 57–84.
- (1996). 'Who sang Sappho's songs?' in Greene (ed.) (1996): 150–172.
- (2009). 'The new Sappho poem (P. Köln 21351 and 21376): Key to the old fragments' in Greene and Skinner (eds) (2009): 41–57.
- Latacz, J. (2005). 'Veilchenbusige Geschenke'. *Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung* 168 (22/7/2005): 33.
- Lechner, G. (2000). 'Kultursemiotische Aspekte textuell erzeugter ästhetischer Ikonizität' in U. Fix and H. Wellmann (eds), *Bild im Text—Text und Bild*. Heidelberg: 217–227.
- Levaniouk, O. (1999). 'Penelope and the *Pênelops*' in M. Carlisle and O. Levaniouk (eds), *Nine Essays on Homer*. Lanham, MD: 95–136.

- Livrea, E. (2007). 'La vecchiaia su papiro: Saffo Simonide Callimaco Cercida' in Bastianini and Casanova (eds) (2007): 67–81.
- Lobel, E. (1925). *Σαπφούς μέλη*. Oxford.
- Lobel, E. and Page, D.L. (1963<sup>2</sup>). *Poetarum Lesbiorum fragmenta*. Oxford. (= L–P)
- Lundon, J. (2007). 'Il nuovo testo lirico nel nuovo papiro di Saffo' in Bastianini and Casanova (eds) (2007): 149–166.
- Luppe, W. (2004). 'Überlegungen zur Gedicht-Anordnung im neuen Sappho-Papyrus'. *ZPE* 149: 7–9.
- Maehler, H. (1963). *Die Auffassung des Dichterberufs im frühen Griechentum bis zur Zeit Pindars*. Hypomnemata 3. Göttingen.
- Magnani, M. (2005). 'Note alla nuova Saffo'. *Eikasmos* 16: 41–49.
- Méndez Dosuna, J. (2008). 'Knees and fawns in the new Sappho'. *Mnemosyne* 61: 108–114.
- Merkelbach, R. (1957). 'Sappho und ihr Kreis'. *Philologus* 101: 1–29. Repr. in W. Blümel et al. (eds), *Hestia und Erigone. Vorträge und Aufsätze*. Stuttgart (1996): 87–114.
- Meyerhoff, D. (1984). *Traditioneller Stoff und individuelle Gestaltung. Untersuchungen zu Alkaios und Sappho*. Hildesheim.
- Mitchell, L.G. (2007). *Panhellenism and the Barbarian in Archaic and Classical Greece*. Swansea.
- Most, G.W. (1997). 'The fire next time. Cosmology, allegoresis, and salvation in the Derveni Papyrus'. *JHS* 117: 117–135.
- Nagy, G. (1990). 'Phaethon, Sappho's Phaon, and the white rock of Leukas: "Reading" the symbols of Greek lyric' in *Greek Mythology and Poetics*. Ithaca, NY: 223–262.
- (1996). *Poetry as Performance. Homer and Beyond*. Cambridge.
- (2007). 'Did Sappho and Alcaeus ever meet? Symmetries of myth and ritual in performing the songs of ancient Lesbos' in A. Bierl, R. Lämmle, and K. Wesselmann (eds), *Literatur und Religion, 1: Wege zu einer mythisch-rituellen Poetik bei den Griechen*. Berlin: 211–269.
- (2009). 'The "New Sappho" reconsidered in the light of the Athenian reception of Sappho' in Greene and Skinner (eds) (2009): 176–199.
- Nussbaum, M.C. (1978). 'The role of *phantasia* in Aristotle's explanation of action' in *Aristotle's De Motu Animalium: Text with Translation, Commentary, and Interpretative Essays*. Princeton: 221–269.
- Obbink, D. (2009). 'Sappho fragments 58–59. Text, apparatus criticus, and translation' in Greene and Skinner (eds) (2009): 7–16.
- Parker, H.N. (1993). 'Sappho schoolmistress'. *TAPhA* 123: 309–351. Repr. in E. Greene (ed.), *Re-Reading Sappho. Reception and Transmission*. Berkeley (1996): 146–183.
- Pitotto, E. (2010–2011). 'Agoni, performance a staffetta e proemi: possibili tracce in PKöln inv. 21351 + 21376'. *Rudiae* 22–23: II 625–658.
- Preisshofen, F. (1977). *Untersuchungen zur Darstellung des Greisenalters in der frühgriechischen Dichtung*. Hermes Einzelschriften 34. Wiesbaden.

- Puelma, M. and F. Angiò. (2005). 'Sappho und Poseidippos: Nachtrag zum Sonnenuhr-Epigramm 52 A.-B. des Mailänder Papyrus'. *ZPE* 152: 13–15.
- Puglia, E. (2007). 'Per la ricomposizione del quarto libro dei canti di Saffo (*P. Oxy.* 1787)'. *SemRom* 10.1: 17–39.
- (2008). 'Appunti sul nuovo testo lirico di Colonia'. *ZPE* 164: 11–18.
- Radke, G. (2006). 'Junge Musen—alte Sappho' in K. Reichert (ed.), *Radikalität des Alters. Prosa—Lyrik—Essay*. Göttingen: 57–70.
- Rawles, R. (2006a). 'Notes on the interpretation of the "New Sappho"'. *ZPE* 157: 1–7.
- (2006b). 'Musical notes on the new anonymous lyric poem from Köln'. *ZPE* 157: 8–13.
- Richardson, J.T.E. (1999). *Mental Imagery*. Hove.
- Rösler, W. (1990). 'Realitätsbezug und Imagination in Sapphos Gedicht ΦΑΙΝΕΤΑΙ ΜΟΙ ΚΗΝΟΣ' in W. Kullmann and M. Reichel (eds), *Der Übergang von der Mündlichkeit zur Literatur bei den Griechen*. Tübingen: 271–287.
- Schadewaldt, W. (1950). *Sappho. Welt und Dichtung, Dasein in der Liebe*. Potsdam.
- Stehle, E. (1997). *Performance and Gender in Ancient Greece. Nondramatic Poetry in Its Setting*. Princeton.
- Steinrück, M. (2007). 'Sapphos Alterslied und kein Ende'. *QUCC* 115: 89–94.
- Tsantsanoglou, K. (1997). 'The first columns of the Derveni Papyrus and their religious significance' in A. Laks and G.W. Most (eds), *Studies on the Derveni Papyrus*. Oxford: 93–128.
- Tsomis, G. (2001). *Zusammenschau der frühgriechischen monodischen Melik (Alkaios, Sappho, Anakreon)*. Stuttgart.
- Tury, A. (1942). 'The Sapphic ostrakon'. *TAPhA* 73: 308–318.
- Yatromanolakis, D. (1999). 'Alexandrian Sappho revisited'. *HSPH* 99: 179–195.
- (2001). 'Visualizing poetry: An early representation of Sappho'. *CPh* 96: 159–168.
- (2005). 'Contrapuntal inscriptions'. *ZPE* 152: 16–30.
- (2007). *Sappho in the Making. The Early Reception*. Cambridge, MA.
- (2008). 'P. Colon. inv. 21351 + 21376 and P.Oxy. 1787 fr. 1: Music, cultural politics, and Hellenistic anthologies'. *Ελληνικά* 58.2: 237–255.
- (2009a). 'Symposia, noses, πρόσωπα: A kylix in the company of banqueters on the ground' in D. Yatromanolakis (ed.), *An Archaeology of Representation: Ancient Greek Vase-Paintings and Contemporary Methodologies*. Athens: 414–464.
- (2009b). 'Alcaeus and Sappho' in F. Budelmann (ed.), *The Cambridge Companion to Greek Lyric*. Cambridge: 204–226.
- (2009c). 'Ancient Greek popular song' in F. Budelmann (ed.), *The Cambridge Companion to Greek Lyric*. Cambridge: 263–276.
- Voigt, E.-M. (1971). *Sappho et Alcaeus: Fragmenta*. Amsterdam. (= v.)
- West, M.L. (1997). 'Hocus-pocus in East and West: Theogony, ritual, and the tradition of

- esoteric commentary' in A. Laks and G.W. Most (eds), *Studies on the Derveni Papyrus*. Oxford: 81–90.
- (2005). 'The New Sappho'. *ZPE* 151: 1–9.
- (2007). 'Phasis and Aia'. *MH* 64: 193–198.
- Williamson, M. (1995). *Sappho's Immortal Daughters*. Cambridge, MA.
- Wilson, L.H. (1996). *Sappho's Sweetbitter Songs: Configurations of Female and Male in Ancient Greek Lyric*. London.
- Winkler, J. (1981). 'Gardens of nymphs: public and private in Sappho's lyrics' in H.P. Foley (ed.), *Reflections of Women in Antiquity*. New York: 63–90. Repr. in Greene (ed.) (1996): 89–109.
- Zusaneck, H. (2005). *Eos. Untersuchungen zum dio-Begriff* 3. Frankfurt a. M.